

BOISE PUBLIC LIBRARY

MAYOR: Lauren McLean | DIRECTOR: Jessica Dorr



- to: Rebecca Lemmons, Board President
- FROM: Jessica Dorr, Library Director
- cc: Boise Public Library Board of Trustees
- DATE: 11/7/2024
- RE: Request for Reconsideration The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold

Overview

On October 24, 2024, Library Staff received a Request for Reconsideration form regarding *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold* by Selina Hastings. This memo provides an overview of the title and its circulation history, an analysis of the title through the lens of the "Children's School and Library Protection Act," and a recommendation to the Board for consideration in the November meeting.

Background

The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold by Selina Hastings was first published in 1994 and remains in print today. The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold was wellreceived when published and has had multiple reprints due to continued interest including a new edition in 2004. After receiving the Request for Reconsideration, staff searched the collection and found that the Boise Public Library owns five copies of the title with a copy at each of our five locations. All copies are in the youth non-fiction collection.

The title was added to the collection in accordance with the Library's <u>Collection</u> <u>Development and Maintenance</u> Policy. While staff were unable to find professional reviews, articles, or awards regarding *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold*, they were able to find public reviews as well as analyze title placement within the youth nonfiction collection. (Screenshots and links to pertinent sites are included at the end of this memo beginning on page five.)

Due to ongoing community interest in children's bibles and stories, staff purchased copies of *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold* for all locations in November 2019 to meet ongoing community interest. Since that time, the copies have been checked out 76 times from the Boise Public Library. In 2023, youth non-fiction titles checked out an average of four times. So far this year, copies of *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold* have met that average.

MAIN LIBRARY 715 S. Capitol Blvd., Boise, Idaho 83702 P: 208-972-8200 | TTY: 800-377-3529 LIBRARY! AT BOWN CROSSING P: 208-972-8360 LIBRARY! AT COLE & USTICK P: 208-972-8300 LIBRARY! AT COLLISTER P: 208-972-8320 LIBRARY! AT HILLCREST P: 208-972-8340

BOISE CITY COUNCIL: Colin Nash (President), Meredith Stead (President Pro Tem), Kathy Corless, Jimmy Hallyburton, Jordan Morales, Luci Willits

Applicability to the "Children's School and Library Protection Act"

This Request for Reconsideration does not meet the legal requirements for being considered under the "Children's School and Library Protection Act" due to the following reasons:

• The request was not filed by or on behalf of an impacted minor.

Request to remove The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold from the Boise Public Library collection

Staff reviewed The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold based on the concerns raised in the Request for Reconsideration form:

- "Presentation of a myth as reality. The sexual content is secondary"
- "Religious indoctrination"
- "Not offer to minors" "21+"
- "In addition to sexual content, there is substantial writing about murder, genocide, slavery and religiously inspired violence."
- The Request for Reconsidered cited nine pages with specific concerns for each page

Staff researched the Dewey Decimal assigned area within the collection, looked at age recommendation by publisher and book vendor, and considered public feedback from review sites. Based on Boise Public Library's <u>The Nature and Quality of Materials</u> Regulation, *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold* meets the criteria to remain in the collection:

- suitability of subject and style for intended audience
- present and potential relevance to community needs
- insight into human and social condition
- skill, competence, and purpose of author
- attention of critics, reviewers, and public
- scope and authority of subject matter
- representation of challenging, though, extreme or minority, point of view
- scope and authority of subject matter

Regarding the concerns that The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold presents myth as a reality and is not appropriate for minors, staff considered the Dewey Decimal placement of the title, recommended ages for the title as well as the public feedback available on review sites.

- The Dewey Decimal system of classification has a range for religion 220-290.
- More specifically, 220.9505 is for "Bible stories retold", which is where The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold is located.
- The publisher markets the title for 8- to 12-year-olds.
- One of our primary book vendors, Ingram, has included the title on their September 2024 Expertly Curated Lists of Top Juv (juvenile) 100s & 200s.



 Public reviews on two sites referenced use of the title with children and grandchildren, and one site referenced use with a 5th/6th grade Catholic religious education program.

Regarding the concerns that The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold is pornographic, staff considered its content under the three prongs of the Miller/Ginsberg Test:

- Based on the opinion of BPL staff and the public ratings on Amazon and Good Reads, as well as the number of times the title has been checked out by users of the Boise Public Library, *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold*, does not violate contemporary community standards.
 - It does not appeal to the prurient interest of minors as judged by the average person.
- While the book does reference sexual content, murder, violence, etc., that in and of itself does not constitute prurient interest and is not patently offensive.
- The Library's version of The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold has 320 pages and with nine called out as concerning. Taken as a whole, BPL staff believe the title has serious literary, artistic, political, and/or scientific value. This is supported by the public reviews linked below.

Then staff considered the concern that The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold is harmful to minors.

- While some reviewers indicate that *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold* is also useful for adults, they did not indicate it was not appropriate for minors. Most reviewers referenced use with older children including several specifically calling out upper elementary ages, which indicates that the publisher age range recommendation of 8-12 years old is appropriate for the content.
- Staff also considered that the title has been reprinted at least three times and has been available since 1994. The fact that it is still showing up on a "Top Juv" list from Ingram, a vendor many libraries use and trust, indicates the strong continuing interest in the topic and the specific title.

Recommendation

Staff acknowledge that The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold is not a title that is of interest to everyone in the Boise community. As stated in the Library's Collection Development and Maintenance Policy, the Board recognizes that the residents of Boise possess widely diverse and separate interests, backgrounds, cultural heritages, social values, and needs. Specifically, The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold provides material for social/religious customs at a younger reading and interest level, which encourages informal self-education.

As noted, The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold is in the youth non-fiction collection. The youth non-fiction collection includes a wide range of topics including religious stories and mythology from various cultures, unexplained phenomenon such as aliens, UFOs and bigfoot, historical accounts of times before humans, narrative non-



fiction, and a range of other topics that some people believe in and some people do not. Staff use the Dewey Decimal Classification system to catalog and shelve materials in a way that will allow people to find topics of interest without the need for them to engage with topics they don't agree with or find of interest.

Based on these findings, staff recommend keeping *The Children's Illustrated Bible: Stories Retold* in the collection and in its current classification number in the youth nonfiction collection.



Documentation:

Dewey Decimal Placement:

← → C ² dewey.org/webdewey/index_11.html?recordId=ddc%3a220.19
SEARCH ADVANCED SEARCH STORE COMMENTS SUPDATES (136) SMARC
Search GO Build
220.1-220.9 Generalities
200 ▼ Religion 220-290 ▼ Bible and specific religions 220 ▼ The Bible 220 ▼ Bible
220.1-220.9 Generalities
220.1 ✓ Origins and authenticity 220.3 Encyclopedias and topical dictionaries 220.4-220.5 ✓ Texts, versions, translations 220.6 ✓ Interpretation and criticism (Exegesis) 220.7 ✓ Commentaries 220.8 ✓ Nonreligious subjects treated in Bible 220.9 ✓ Geography, history, chronology, persons of Bible lands in Bible times
 ← → C
Search GO
220.95 History
200 ▼ Religion 220-290 ▼ Bible and specific religions 220 ▼ The Bible 220 ▼ Bible 220.1-220.9 ▼ Generalities 220.9 ▼ Geography, history, chronology, persons of Bible lands in Bible times
220.95 History
220.95/001-220.95/009Standard subdivisions220.95/05Bible stories retold



Other review sites:

Good Reads: https://www.goodreads.com/book/show/237432

Amazon:

https://www.amazon.com/Childrens-Illustrated-Bible-Selina-Hastings/dp/1405303255

Alibris: https://www.alibris.com/reviews/book/1058634/The-children%27s-illustrated-Bible



